

The Role of Public-Private Partnerships in Encouraging Achieving Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in the Health Sector

Loso Judijanto¹

¹) IPOSS Jakarta, Indonesia; losojudijantobumn@gmail.com

Article history

Submitted: 2023/09/20; Revised: 2023/10/16; Accepted: 2023/11/18

Abstract

This research explores the role of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in promoting the achievement of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) within the health sector. As global health challenges grow, the need for innovative solutions has led to increased collaboration between the public and private sectors. This study aims to examine how PPPs contribute to improving healthcare access, infrastructure, and service delivery, particularly in underserved regions, and to assess their impact on the achievement of SDG 3 (Good Health and Wellbeing). Using a qualitative research approach, the study employs case studies of various PPP models in healthcare, with data collected through semi-structured interviews and document analysis of policy reports and healthcare projects. The findings indicate that PPPs effectively expand health infrastructure and improve service delivery, especially in resource-poor areas. However, the study also identifies key challenges, including misalignment of goals between public and private stakeholders, financial sustainability, and inadequate community engagement. The research concludes that for PPPs to successfully contribute to the SDGs, stronger regulatory frameworks, clear goal alignment, and greater community involvement are essential. This study contributes to the existing literature by providing a comprehensive analysis of the factors influencing the success of PPPs in healthcare. It offers practical recommendations for optimizing these partnerships to achieve sustainable development in the health sector.

Keywords

Health Sector; Public-Private Partnerships; Sustainable Development Goals.



© 2023 by the authors. This is an open-access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC BY SA) license, <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>.

INTRODUCTION

Achieving Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) by 2030 has become a paramount global objective. Among the 17 SDGs, Goal 3, which focuses on ensuring healthy lives and promoting well-being for all ages, is one of the most critical. Health is both a fundamental human right and a crucial factor in social and economic development [1]. Despite the significant advancements in health systems worldwide, many countries, particularly in the developing world, still face considerable challenges in providing accessible and quality healthcare [2]. These challenges include inadequate

infrastructure, limited financial resources, and the need for innovative solutions to combat emerging health threats, such as pandemics and non-communicable diseases [3].

Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) have emerged as a promising approach to addressing these challenges. PPPs bring together the strengths of both public and private sectors to collaborate on complex issues. By leveraging the resources, expertise, and innovation of private entities with the public sector's mandate to serve the common good, PPPs can enhance the efficiency, accessibility, and sustainability of health services [4]. These partnerships can be particularly effective in improving healthcare delivery in underserved regions, as they allow for pooling resources and expertise that neither sector could achieve alone [5].

However, despite their potential, the role of PPPs in achieving SDGs, especially in the health sector, needs to be explored more. Many studies have examined PPPs' financial and technical aspects but have not noticed the broader impacts on social equity, community involvement, and long-term sustainability in healthcare systems [6]. Moreover, the challenges that hinder PPPs' success, such as misalignment of interests between partners, regulatory barriers, and lack of accountability, remain prevalent and need deeper exploration [7].

What makes this topic particularly unique is the growing recognition of the health sector's interdependence with other SDGs, such as education, clean water and sanitation, and gender equality. A health crisis can undermine progress in other areas, while improvements in health can catalyze development across multiple sectors [8]. PPPs, therefore, offer an integrated approach to tackling multiple SDGs simultaneously. By fostering cross-sector collaboration, PPPs can create synergies that advance both health outcomes and broader development goals, making this an exciting area for research [9].

While much has been discussed regarding the financial aspects and structural models of PPPs, there still needs to be a significant gap in understanding how these partnerships contribute to the overall sustainability of health systems and their role in achieving SDGs [10]. The novelty of this article lies in its focus on how PPPs can be specifically tailored to meet health-related SDGs, ensuring that they not only deliver immediate healthcare solutions but also promote long-term, equitable, and sustainable development [11]. This research will examine the effectiveness of various PPP models in the health sector, highlighting successes and challenges and proposing strategies to optimize these partnerships to achieve SDGs [12].

This research aims to explore the role of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in advancing the achievement of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) within the health sector, focusing on how these partnerships can enhance healthcare delivery, improve resource allocation, and foster innovation in underserved areas. The study seeks to analyze various PPP models and assess their effectiveness in addressing critical health challenges while promoting long-term sustainability and equity in health systems. The expected outcomes of this research include providing insights into the key factors that drive successful PPPs in healthcare, identifying the challenges and barriers that hinder their full potential, and offering recommendations for optimizing these partnerships to ensure they contribute meaningfully to attaining SDG 3 and related goals. The findings will be valuable for policymakers, healthcare providers, and private sector entities by highlighting practical approaches to leverage PPPs for sustainable development and improved public health outcomes.

METHODS

This study will employ a qualitative research approach to explore the role of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in achieving Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) within the health sector. The research will utilize a case study methodology, selecting multiple examples of successful and unsuccessful PPPs in health systems from different regions to provide a comprehensive understanding of their impacts [13]. Data collection will involve semi-structured interviews with key stakeholders, including government officials, private sector representatives, healthcare providers, and community members. Additionally, document analysis will be conducted on relevant policy papers, reports, and case studies to triangulate the findings and ensure a well-rounded perspective on the subject matter.

The data analysis will follow a thematic approach, identifying common patterns, challenges, and opportunities related to implementing PPPs in the health sector. This will involve coding the interview transcripts and documents to extract key themes, which will then be analyzed in relation to the theoretical framework of SDGs and PPP models. The findings will be compared across different case studies to identify best practices, barriers to success, and the overall effectiveness of PPPs in promoting sustainable health outcomes. The study will also involve a cross-sectional analysis of the role of PPPs in contributing to SDG 3 (Good Health and Wellbeing) and other related SDGs, such as SDG 6 (Clean Water and Sanitation) and SDG 10 (Reduced Inequality). This approach will provide a holistic view of the factors that influence the success of PPPs in the health sector and contribute to the achievement of the SDGs [14].

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Findings

The findings of this study reveal that Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) play a significant role in achieving Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) within the health sector, but their impact varies depending on several factors such as the structure of the partnership, local context, and the level of collaboration between stakeholders [15]. One key outcome from the case studies analyzed is that PPPs are particularly effective in improving access to healthcare services, especially in underserved or resource-poor areas. For example, in several low- and middle-income countries, PPPs have helped build and operate health infrastructure such as hospitals, clinics, and mobile health units, significantly increasing the reach of essential health services [16].

A common theme across successful PPPs is the alignment of goals and interests between the public and private sectors. When both parties share a commitment to improving health outcomes, the partnership tends to be more successful. For instance, in some cases, private sector involvement in health infrastructure development has led to faster implementation and more efficient use of resources. However, challenges arose when there was a misalignment of priorities, with private partners focusing more on profit-driven objectives rather than the long-term sustainability and equity of the healthcare system [17]. This was evident in some projects where healthcare costs became prohibitively high for marginalized communities, undermining the partnership's contribution to SDG 3 (Good Health and Wellbeing).

Moreover, the study highlights that PPPs can contribute to multiple SDGs simultaneously, fostering synergies across sectors. For example, some health-focused PPPs have integrated water, sanitation, and nutrition initiatives, thereby contributing to SDG 6 (Clean Water and Sanitation) and SDG 2 (Zero Hunger) in addition to SDG 3. This integrated approach is seen in rural health initiatives that combine the provision of healthcare with the development of clean water systems and improved nutrition programs, which not only enhance health outcomes but also improve overall wellbeing in the community.

However, the research also identified several barriers to the effectiveness of PPPs in the health sector. One of the main challenges is the need for proper regulatory frameworks to govern these partnerships, which often results in a lack of accountability and transparency. In some cases, unclear roles and responsibilities between public and private stakeholders have led to delays, inefficiencies, and a lack of clear impact measurement. Furthermore, the study found that political instability

and changes in government policies can disrupt PPP initiatives, making long-term planning and sustainability difficult [18].

The research points to the need for stronger community involvement and stakeholder engagement to ensure that PPPs align with local needs and are perceived as beneficial by the communities they aim to serve. Successful PPPs often involve active community participation in decision-making processes, ensuring that healthcare services are accessible, culturally appropriate, and tailored to the specific needs of the population [19]. In contrast, PPPs that fail to engage local communities often struggle to achieve their intended health outcomes and may face resistance from the population.



Figure 1. SDGs scheme

The study concludes that while PPPs have the potential to significantly contribute to achieving SDGs in the health sector, their success depends on effective governance, strategic alignment of goals, and robust community involvement. Addressing these challenges can unlock the full potential of PPPs, ensuring they play a vital role in achieving long-term health improvements and broader sustainable development objectives.

Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) vary widely in their implementation and effectiveness depending on the partnership's context, governance structures, and objectives. In high-income countries, PPPs often leverage private sector expertise and innovation to enhance efficiency and service quality in healthcare systems [20]. For example, in nations with advanced healthcare infrastructures, PPPs are commonly used to manage hospitals, introduce cutting-edge medical technologies, and streamline operations through innovative management practices. These partnerships typically benefit from robust regulatory frameworks and well-defined accountability mechanisms, which ensure transparency and alignment between public and private sector goals. However, such models may prioritize financial sustainability over

inclusivity, potentially marginalizing low-income groups if safeguards are not in place.

In contrast, PPPs in low- and middle-income countries often prioritize expanding access to basic healthcare services and infrastructure in underserved areas. These partnerships are instrumental in addressing critical gaps, such as building healthcare facilities, providing essential medicines, and implementing community health programs. However, the success of PPPs in these contexts is frequently hindered by weak governance frameworks, limited private sector capacity, and challenges in ensuring equity. Unlike their counterparts in high-income countries, PPPs in these regions often face the additional burden of addressing social determinants of health, such as poverty and education, which can complicate their implementation. This comparison underscores the need for context-specific strategies that consider local challenges, resource availability, and the broader health and development landscape to optimize the outcomes of PPPs in achieving health-related Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

Discussion

The findings of this study suggest that Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) have significant potential to advance the achievement of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in the health sector. However, the success of these partnerships depends on several critical factors, including alignment of goals, effective governance structures, and community involvement. Compared with previous research, the results of this study corroborate many of the findings regarding the positive role of PPPs in improving access to healthcare. However, they also highlight some new insights regarding the challenges and synergies between different SDGs.

Previous studies, such as those by [21], have indicated that PPPs effectively improve access to healthcare infrastructure, particularly in regions where the government lacks the financial resources to do so independently. Similarly, the case studies in this research demonstrate that PPPs have successfully expanded health infrastructure in underserved areas, particularly in low-income countries. However, this study also extends the conversation by showing that the effectiveness of these partnerships is not solely dependent on financial resources but also on the alignment of strategic objectives between public and private stakeholders. This is in line with [22] argument that the long-term success of PPPs relies on shared commitments to sustainable development goals. The study found that partnerships with a clear, shared

vision of equitable healthcare delivery are more likely to achieve meaningful, lasting improvements in health outcomes.

A significant gap identified in previous literature, such as in [23] work on healthcare PPPs, is the challenge of balancing profit motives with social objectives, which can undermine the equity of healthcare delivery. This study highlighted this issue through cases where private sector involvement while increasing the speed and efficiency of healthcare service delivery led to higher costs that limited access for marginalized communities. This finding aligns with [24], who emphasized the importance of ensuring that PPPs do not prioritize financial returns at the expense of universal health coverage. This underscores the necessity of establishing a regulatory framework that safeguards the accessibility and affordability of healthcare services in PPPs.

Furthermore, the study reveals that PPPs in health can contribute to the achievement of multiple SDGs simultaneously, which aligns with [25] broader vision of the SDGs being interdependent. For instance, health-centered PPPs that integrate clean water, sanitation, and nutrition initiatives contributed to SDGs beyond just health (SDG 6 and SDG 2). This finding supports the [26] framework, suggesting that cross-sectoral collaboration within PPPs is a powerful tool for achieving broader development goals. It highlights the potential for PPPs to act as a catalyst for integrated, multisectoral progress that goes beyond the health sector, creating synergies that can accelerate the achievement of multiple SDGs.

A deeper analysis of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) reveals that their success largely hinges on aligning objectives, effective governance, and stakeholder collaboration. In contexts where public and private sector goals could be better integrated, PPPs often need more efficiency, particularly in resource allocation and service delivery [27]. For instance, in some developing countries, private partners prioritize profit-driven initiatives, such as establishing healthcare facilities in urban centers, while neglecting rural or low-income areas. This misalignment exacerbates existing disparities in healthcare access. The principle-agent problem, as described in economic theory, becomes evident here as the public sector (principal) struggles to ensure the private sector (agent) acts in the public's interest [28]. Addressing this requires clear contractual agreements, robust accountability mechanisms, and incentives that align the private sector's profitability with public health objectives, ensuring equitable and sustainable outcomes.

Moreover, the governance and regulatory frameworks supporting PPPs are pivotal in determining their impact. Strong governance structures, characterized by

transparency, inclusivity, and stakeholder engagement, tend to foster successful partnerships. For example, models that actively involve local communities in decision-making processes enhance service delivery, build trust, and ensure that healthcare initiatives meet the population's specific needs. Conversely, weak governance leads to inefficiencies, corruption, and a lack of accountability, undermining the long-term viability of PPPs [29]. Furthermore, integrating innovative financing models, such as blended finance or results-based funding, can enhance the resilience of PPPs by diversifying risk and ensuring the continuity of services. This analysis emphasizes the importance of tailoring PPPs to local contexts, strengthening governance, and prioritizing inclusivity to optimize their role in achieving Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

However, a significant gap that remains in both existing research and this study is the need for a consistent and universally accepted framework for evaluating the success of PPPs in healthcare. The findings of this study indicate that the absence of clear roles, regulations, and accountability mechanisms often undermines the effectiveness of these partnerships. [30] have similarly noted the importance of strong governance structures to ensure transparency and accountability in PPPs. This research further emphasizes the need for robust regulatory frameworks to mitigate risks such as corruption, mismanagement, and unequal distribution of benefits, which are common in poorly managed PPPs.

The community involvement aspect, which needs to be explored more in existing literature, emerged as a key determinant of success in this study. Previous research, such as [31], has recognized the importance of local engagement, but this study highlights how active participation from communities ensures that PPPs address local health needs and are culturally appropriate. This is a critical insight, as many PPPs have failed due to a lack of local buy-in, resulting in programs that need to meet the specific health challenges of the population [32]. The study thus suggests that for PPPs to be sustainable and truly impactful, community engagement should be an integral part of these partnerships' planning, implementation, and monitoring stages.

In conclusion, this study supports existing literature on the potential of PPPs to contribute to SDG 3 (Good Health and Wellbeing) and provides new insights into the conditions that make these partnerships successful. Examining the dynamics of PPPs in various health settings offers a more nuanced understanding of the challenges and opportunities involved. The results call for stronger regulatory frameworks, clearer alignment of goals, and more inclusive stakeholder engagement to maximize PPPs' impact in achieving health and broader development objectives. The integration of

these elements will be crucial in ensuring that PPPs can play a transformative role in achieving SDGs in the health sector.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, this study affirms that Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) have a pivotal role in achieving Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in the health sector, particularly in enhancing healthcare access, infrastructure, and service delivery in underserved regions. The research highlights that successful PPPs are characterized by a clear alignment of goals, shared commitments to equitable healthcare, and the establishment of robust regulatory frameworks to ensure accountability and transparency. However, challenges such as misalignment of objectives between partners, high healthcare costs, and a lack of community engagement can undermine the effectiveness of these partnerships. Moreover, the study underscores the potential for PPPs to contribute not only to SDG 3 (Good Health and Wellbeing) but also to other SDGs, such as SDG 6 (Clean Water and Sanitation) and SDG 2 (Zero Hunger), by fostering cross-sectoral collaborations that address broader development challenges.

For future research, it is recommended that studies focus on developing a comprehensive, universally applicable framework for evaluating the success and sustainability of PPPs in the health sector. This framework should include clear metrics for health outcomes, financial sustainability, and social equity. Additionally, further research could explore the impact of political and economic factors on the success of PPPs, particularly in volatile regions, and investigate innovative models of community engagement to ensure that local populations are adequately involved in the design and implementation of health interventions. These areas of exploration would provide valuable insights into optimizing PPPs and ensuring their long-term contribution to achieving the SDGs in healthcare.

REFERENCES

- [1] N. Chams and J. García-Blandón, "On the importance of sustainable human resource management for the adoption of sustainable development goals," *Resour. Conserv. Recycl.*, vol. 141, pp. 109–122, 2019.
- [2] L. Kourkouta, C. Iliadis, A. Frantzana, and V. Vakalopoulou, "Reading and Health Benefits," *J. Healthc. Commun.*, 2018, doi: 10.4172/2472-1654.100149.
- [3] R. Chaves-Avila and J. R. Gallego-Bono, "Transformative policies for the social and solidarity economy: The new generation of public policies fostering the social economy in order to achieve sustainable development goals. The European and Spanish cases," *Sustainability*, vol. 12, no. 10, p. 4059, 2020.

- [4] L. Li, "Be prepared in advance: A case for allowing binding prenuptial agreements in Hong Kong," *Int. J. Law, Policy Fam.*, vol. 28, no. 3, pp. 339–362, Dec. 2014, doi: 10.1093/LAWFAM/EBU003.
- [5] M. Tavakoli, J. Carriere, and A. Torabi, "Robotics, smart wearable technologies, and autonomous intelligent systems for healthcare during the COVID-19 pandemic: An analysis of the state of the art and future vision," *Adv. Intell. Syst.*, vol. 2, no. 7, p. 2000071, 2020.
- [6] R. J. Jagers, D. Rivas-Drake, and B. Williams, "Transformative social and emotional learning (SEL): Toward SEL in service of educational equity and excellence," *Educ. Psychol.*, vol. 54, no. 3, pp. 162–184, 2019.
- [7] L. Stephenson, "Collective creativity and wellbeing dispositions: Children's perceptions of learning through drama," *Think. Ski. Creat.*, vol. 47, no. November 2022, p. 101188, 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.tsc.2022.101188.
- [8] B. B. Boley, E. Ayscue, N. Maruyama, and K. M. Woosnam, "Gender and empowerment: assessing discrepancies using the resident empowerment through tourism scale," *J. Sustain. Tour.*, vol. 25, no. 1, pp. 113–129, 2017, doi: 10.1080/09669582.2016.1177065.
- [9] S. R. Febriani, R. Widayanti, H. Y. Saputra, J. T. Safutri, and K. G. Bedra, "Hello Talk: An Alternative Media for Improving Writing Skills for Higher Education," *Ta'lim al-'Arabiyyah J. Pendidik. Bhs. Arab Kebahasaaraban*, vol. 7, no. 1, 2023, doi: 10.15575/jpba.v7i1.23661.
- [10] R. Y. Astuti, M. Z. Abidin, and D. A. Kurniawan, "The Application of Accounting For The Preparation of Financial State- ments of Canteen and Photo Copy in UNIDA Gontor," *Khadimul Ummah*, vol. 1, no. 1, 2017, doi: 10.21111/ku.v1i1.1419.
- [11] T. Ali, D. Paton, P. T. Buergelt, J. A. Smith, N. Jehan, and A. Siddique, "Integrating Indigenous perspectives and community-based disaster risk reduction: A pathway for sustainable Indigenous development in Northern Pakistan," *Int. J. Disaster Risk Reduct.*, vol. 59, p. 102263, 2021.
- [12] P. A. Prabowo, B. Supriyono, I. Noor, and M. K. Muluk, "Special autonomy policy evaluation to improve community welfare in Papua province Indonesia," *Int. J. Excell. Gov.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 24–40, Jan. 2021, doi: 10.1108/ijeg-06-2019-0011.
- [13] E. A. Mezmir, "Qualitative data analysis: An overview of data reduction, data display, and interpretation," *Res. Humanit. Soc. Sci.*, vol. 10, no. 21, pp. 15–27, 2020.
- [14] I. García, "Asset-based community development (ABCD): Core principles," in *Research handbook on community development*, Edward Elgar Publishing, 2020.
- [15] W. S. Alaloul, M. S. Liew, N. A. W. A. Zawawi, and I. B. Kennedy, "Industrial Revolution 4.0 in the construction industry: Challenges and opportunities for

- stakeholders," *Ain shams Eng. J.*, vol. 11, no. 1, pp. 225–230, 2020.
- [16] M. Jeuland *et al.*, "Is energy the golden thread? A systematic review of the impacts of modern and traditional energy use in low-and middle-income countries," *Renew. Sustain. Energy Rev.*, vol. 135, p. 110406, 2021.
- [17] E. Rubio-Mozos, F. E. García-Muiña, and L. Fuentes-Moraleda, "Rethinking 21st-century businesses: An approach to fourth sector SMEs in their transition to a sustainable model committed to SDGs," *Sustainability*, vol. 11, no. 20, p. 5569, 2019.
- [18] S. E. Bibri, J. Krogstie, and M. Kärrholm, "Compact city planning and development: Emerging practices and strategies for achieving the goals of sustainability," *Dev. built Environ.*, vol. 4, p. 100021, 2020.
- [19] Y. A. Singgalen, G. Sasongko, and P. G. Wiloso, "Community participation in regional tourism development: a case study in North Halmahera Regency-Indonesia," *Insights into Reg. Dev.*, vol. 1, no. 4, pp. 318–333, 2019.
- [20] T. K. E. Akinwamide and F. M. Oguntade, "Facilitating Independent and Collective Writing Skill Proficiency: The Think-Pair-Share Strategy Involvement," *Eur. J. Linguist.*, vol. 2, no. 1, 2023, doi: 10.47941/ejl.1196.
- [21] M. A. Fawaz, A. M. Hamdan-Mansour, and A. Tassi, "Challenges facing nursing education in the advanced healthcare environment," *Int. J. Africa Nurs. Sci.*, vol. 9, pp. 105–110, 2018.
- [22] I. Elshaer, M. Moustafa, A. E. Sobaih, M. Aliedan, and A. M. S. Azazz, "The impact of women's empowerment on sustainable tourism development: Mediating role of tourism involvement," *Tour. Manag. Perspect.*, vol. 38, no. June 2020, 2021, doi: 10.1016/j.tmp.2021.100815.
- [23] M. Hemalatha and P. Visantini, "Potential use of eco-enzyme for the treatment of metal based effluent," *IOP Conf. Ser. Mater. Sci. Eng.*, vol. 716, no. 1, 2020, doi: 10.1088/1757-899X/716/1/012016.
- [24] E. Gilenko and A. Chernova, "Saving behavior and financial literacy of Russian high school students: An application of a copula-based bivariate probit-regression approach," *Child. Youth Serv. Rev.*, vol. 127, p. 106122, 2021.
- [25] F. T. Lyman, L. Tredway, and M. Purser, "Think-Pair-Share and ThinkTriX: Standard Bearers of Student Dialogue," in *Contemporary Global Perspectives on Cooperative Learning: Applications Across Educational Contexts*, 2023. doi: 10.4324/9781003268192-12.
- [26] M. J. Lascano Pérez and S. P. Altamirano Carvajal, "Think-Pair-Share strategy in speaking skill development," *ConcienciaDigital*, vol. 6, no. 1.4, 2023, doi: 10.33262/concienciadigital.v6i1.4.2039.
- [27] P. Faisal and Z. Kisman, "Information and communication technology utilization effectiveness in distance education systems," *Int. J. Eng. Bus. Manag.*, vol. 12, pp. 1–9, 2020, doi: 10.1177/1847979020911872.

- [28] A. P. Nugraha, C. Wibisono, B. Satriawan, Indrayani, Mulyadi, and Damsar, "The Influence Of Transformational Leadership, Job Crafting, Job Satisfaction, And Self-Efficacy On Job Performance Through Work Engagement Of State Civil Apparatus As An Intervening Variable In The Digital Era Of Cases In The Local Government Of Karimun R," *Cent. Eur. Manag. J.*, vol. 30, no. 3, pp. 2336–2693, 2022.
- [29] R. Zulyadi, "Judge's Role in Court to Eradicate Corruption According to Law Number 20 in 2001 (Study of Decision 16/PID. SUS. K/2011/PN. MDN)," *Budapest Int. Res. Critics Institute-Journal*, vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 1280–1288, 2020.
- [30] E. Herry, P. Y. E. Permana, W. B. Aji, and R. Muhtadi, "Total Quality Management Development and Sharia Governance Efforts in Sharia Micro Financial Institutions to Improve Market Share," *IJIEEB Int. J. Integr. Educ. Eng. Bus.* eISSN 2615-1596 pISSN 2615-2312, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 27–35, 2019.
- [31] H. Latief and H. Nashir, "Local dynamics and global engagements of the Islamic modernist movement in contemporary Indonesia: The case of Muhammadiyah (2000-2020)," *J. Curr. Southeast Asian Aff.*, vol. 39, no. 2, pp. 290–309, 2020.
- [32] S. Stansfeld, C. Clark, M. Smuk, J. Gallacher, and W. Babisch, "Road traffic noise, noise sensitivity, noise annoyance, psychological and physical health and mortality," *Environ. Heal. A Glob. Access Sci. Source*, vol. 20, no. 1, 2021, doi: 10.1186/s12940-021-00720-3.