

Evaluation of Fresh Graduate Recruitment Using the CIPP Model at PT Prima Sarana Gemilang

Mohammad Burhannudin

¹ Universitas Paramadina, Indonesia

* Correspondence e-mail; burhannudin.mohammad@gmail.com*

Article history

Submitted: 2026/02/01; Revised: 2026/03/11; Accepted: 2026/06/11

Abstract

This study aims to evaluate the recruitment strategy of the Prima Management Development Program at PT Prima Sarana Gemilang using the Context, Input, Process, Product evaluation model. The program was developed as a company strategy to recruit and prepare potential employees, especially fresh graduates, to support operational needs in the mining industry. This study employed a descriptive qualitative method with data collection techniques through interviews, observations, and documentation. Research informants consisted of the Human Resources General Manager, Talent Acquisition Supervisor, and participants of the Prima Management Development Program selected using purposive sampling techniques. The results showed that the program was aligned with the company's needs in building a talent pipeline and supporting workforce regeneration. The company has also implemented a relatively structured recruitment system through standard operating procedures, digital recruitment media, and competency-based selection stages. However, several obstacles were still identified, including limited recruiters, inconsistent candidate assessment standards, changes in selection schedules, and insufficient communication with candidates during the recruitment process. In addition, several fresh graduate participants still required strengthening of technical competencies and adaptation to the mining industry work culture. Overall, the recruitment strategy of the Prima Management Development Program was considered sufficiently effective in supporting company talent development, although improvements are still needed in the implementation and development aspects of the program

Keywords

Recruitment, Fresh Graduate, Management Trainee, Cipp Model, Talent Management



© 2026 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC BY SA) license, <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>.

INTRODUCTION

In today's increasingly dynamic and competitive business environment, organizations are required to possess competent, adaptive, and high-performing human resources (HR) to maintain sustainable competitive advantages. Human resources play a crucial role in organizational success because they contribute directly to productivity, innovation, and organizational performance. Therefore,

recruitment has become one of the most strategic functions in human resource management, as it determines an organization's ability to attract, select, and retain qualified employees who can support the achievement of organizational objectives (Armstrong & Taylor, 2014; Rahayuningsih, 2019).

The mining industry faces unique challenges in human resource management due to its demanding operational environment, technological complexity, and the need for highly skilled personnel. Companies operating in this sector require employees who not only possess technical competencies but also demonstrate leadership potential, adaptability, and readiness to work in remote operational areas. As a mining contractor company, PT Prima Sarana Gemilang (PSG) encounters challenges in fulfilling workforce requirements, particularly for technical and field supervisory positions. The limited availability of candidates who meet industry-specific qualifications has encouraged the company to develop innovative recruitment strategies that support long-term workforce sustainability and organizational growth.

One of the strategic initiatives implemented by PT Prima Sarana Gemilang is the Prima Management Development Program (PMDP), a recruitment and talent development program specifically designed for fresh graduates. The program aims to identify high-potential candidates and prepare them through a structured process consisting of recruitment, selection, onboarding, training, and competency development. Management Trainee programs such as PMDP have become increasingly important in talent management because they help organizations build internal talent pipelines, support succession planning, and reduce dependence on external recruitment sources (Armstrong & Taylor, 2014). Furthermore, effective graduate development programs can contribute to employee retention and leadership development, thereby strengthening organizational competitiveness in the long term (Dessler, 2020).

Despite its strategic role, the implementation of PMDP continues to face several challenges. These challenges include ensuring the effectiveness of recruitment and selection processes, maintaining consistency and objectivity in candidate assessment, improving communication throughout the recruitment stages, and ensuring that program outcomes align with organizational workforce requirements. In addition, several participants withdraw during the early stages of placement due to mismatched expectations regarding work conditions and assignments in mining operational areas. Such conditions indicate that a comprehensive evaluation is

necessary to assess the effectiveness of the PMDP recruitment strategy and identify areas requiring improvement.

Program evaluation is an important managerial activity because it provides evidence regarding the effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability of organizational programs. Among various evaluation approaches, the Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) model developed by Stufflebeam is recognized as one of the most comprehensive evaluation frameworks. The CIPP model evaluates programs from four dimensions: program needs and objectives (context), resource readiness and planning (input), implementation activities (process), and outcomes or impacts (product). This model enables organizations not only to assess final results but also to identify strengths and weaknesses throughout the program implementation process, thereby facilitating continuous improvement and informed decision-making (Stufflebeam & Shinkfield, 2007; Sopha & Nanni, 2019).

Previous studies have demonstrated the effectiveness of the CIPP model in evaluating recruitment, training, and human resource development programs. Azmy (2019) found that the CIPP model provided a comprehensive assessment of lecturer recruitment programs by evaluating program objectives, resource readiness, implementation quality, and recruitment outcomes. Similarly, studies conducted by Unika Olo et al. (2026), Subagiyo et al. (2026), and Alifah et al. (2025) revealed that the CIPP framework effectively identifies strengths and weaknesses in recruitment and selection systems, thereby supporting organizational decision-making and program improvement. However, most previous studies have focused on educational institutions, public organizations, and non-profit sectors, while research examining Management Trainee-based recruitment programs in the mining industry remains limited.

This gap indicates the need for further investigation into the effectiveness of graduate recruitment programs within industries characterized by highly specialized workforce requirements. Furthermore, limited empirical evidence is available regarding the application of the CIPP model in evaluating fresh graduate recruitment strategies designed to support long-term talent development in mining companies. Therefore, this study aims to evaluate the implementation of the Prima Management Development Program (PMDP) at PT Prima Sarana Gemilang using the CIPP evaluation model. Specifically, the study examines the suitability of the program with organizational needs (context), the adequacy of supporting resources and recruitment strategies (input), the effectiveness of recruitment implementation (process), and the outcomes achieved by the program (product). The findings are

expected to contribute to the literature on recruitment evaluation and talent management while providing practical recommendations for improving fresh graduate recruitment and development programs in the mining industry.

METHODS

The Management Trainee (MT) Program is a strategic human resource development initiative designed to prepare high-potential fresh graduates to become future leaders through a structured and systematic learning process. Unlike conventional recruitment programs, Management Trainee programs integrate technical training, leadership development, mentoring, job rotation, and performance evaluation to accelerate employee readiness for managerial and strategic positions within an organization. Consequently, MT programs are widely recognized as an effective mechanism for succession planning and long-term talent management because they facilitate the development of internal talent pipelines that support organizational sustainability (Armstrong & Taylor, 2014; Dessler, 2020).

For fresh graduates, the transition from higher education to the workplace often presents significant challenges due to limited work experience, inadequate practical skills, and difficulties adapting to professional environments. As a result, organizations increasingly utilize Management Trainee programs as a bridge between academic learning and workplace demands. Through structured training and continuous development activities, participants are provided with opportunities to enhance both technical competencies and managerial capabilities, enabling them to adapt more effectively to organizational requirements and improve their employability in a competitive labor market. Previous studies indicate that fresh graduates generally experience an adjustment phase that requires systematic guidance and competency development to facilitate successful integration into the workforce (Sinamo & Simarmata, 2023).

At PT Prima Sarana Gemilang (PSG), this concept is implemented through the Prima Management Development Program (PMDP), which functions not only as a recruitment mechanism but also as a long-term talent development strategy. The PMDP is specifically designed to address workforce challenges in the mining industry, particularly the limited availability of candidates who possess the technical competencies, adaptability, and leadership potential required in operational environments. Through a structured recruitment and development process, the program seeks to identify high-potential candidates and prepare them to meet the company's future workforce requirements.

From a strategic perspective, Management Trainee programs such as PMDP contribute significantly to organizational effectiveness by reducing dependence on external recruitment, enhancing employee retention, and ensuring alignment between individual competencies and organizational needs. Furthermore, these programs enable companies to cultivate future leaders who understand organizational culture, business processes, and operational challenges from an early stage of their careers. Therefore, the implementation of PMDP represents an important investment in human capital development and serves as a strategic approach to supporting sustainable organizational growth within the highly competitive mining industry (Armstrong & Taylor, 2014; Dessler, 2020).

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Context Evaluation

A context evaluation was conducted to determine the suitability of the PMDP program to the organization's needs and the background of the program's implementation. Based on interviews with the HR General Manager and Talent Acquisition Supervisor, the PMDP program was established due to the company's challenges in recruiting a workforce suited to the needs of the mining industry, particularly for technical and field supervisory positions. Furthermore, the high demand for workforce regeneration and competition for qualified candidates were key factors in the company's development of a Management Trainee-based program. The research results indicate that the PMDP program's objectives align with the organization's needs, namely developing competent, adaptable human resources ready for placement within the company's operational areas. The program is also designed to support organizational sustainability through the development of potential internal leaders.

However, several challenges remain in the context aspect, such as the limited number of fresh graduate candidates with an understanding of the mining industry and the low interest of some candidates in site placements. These conditions necessitate the company implementing a broader branding and candidate sourcing strategy to secure talent that aligns with the organization's needs. The findings of this study align with research (Manasikana & Noor, 2025), which states that the contextual aspect of recruitment is influenced by organizational needs and the limited availability of candidates with the required competencies.

Input Evaluation

Input evaluation was conducted to assess the readiness of resources, support systems, planning, and strategies used in implementing PMDP recruitment. Based on

observations and documentation, PT Prima Sarana Gemilang has established recruitment SOPs, HR business processes, and a structured PMDP selection process as guidelines for program implementation.

The PMDP recruitment strategy is implemented through several channels, such as online job search platforms, company social media, collaborations with universities, job fairs, and employee referrals. The use of digital media is considered to help the company expand its candidate reach and increase the effectiveness of job postings.

Furthermore, the company involved several parties in the selection process, such as HR Recruitment, the user department, and external psychologists, to ensure a more objective candidate assessment process. The readiness of the administrative system and the use of assessment tools in the selection process also supported a more systematic candidate evaluation process.

However, the research results indicated that several input constraints remained, such as the limited number of recruiters compared to the large number of applicants, and the relatively short selection process time, which impacted the effectiveness of the candidate screening process. Furthermore, several informants stated that the standardization of assessments across user interviews was still not fully consistent.

These results support research by Azmy (2019), which indicates that input aspects in recruitment evaluation are often influenced by resource readiness, coordination between relevant parties, and organizational system and facility support.

Process Evaluation

Process evaluation was conducted to determine the effectiveness of the PMDP recruitment and selection process. Based on the research results, the PMDP recruitment process was conducted in accordance with the company's established procedures and procedures, from job posting, CV screening, psychological testing, HR interviews, user interviews, medical check-ups, to offering and onboarding participants. The selection process was deemed systematic and transparent, as each candidate followed the same steps, in accordance with company standards. The use of psychological tests and competency-based interviews helped the company assess candidates' technical abilities, leadership potential, and their suitability to the organization's culture.

Based on PMDP recruitment data, out of a total of 6,534 applicants, only 120 candidates successfully passed the interview stage, and 95 candidates were accepted into the PMDP program. This demonstrates that the company implemented a

rigorous selection process to ensure candidates' competencies align with the organization's needs. The high number of candidates screened at each stage demonstrates that the selection process was systematic and competitive.

However, observations revealed that challenges persisted at several stages, such as sudden changes to the selection schedule, the lengthy recruitment process, and limited communication with candidates regarding the selection process. Furthermore, under certain circumstances, pressure from manpower needs resulted in relatively rapid recruitment decisions.

Several PMDP participants also stated that the selection process was competitive and challenging, but that more detailed information regarding job descriptions and placements needed to be provided from the beginning of the recruitment process to provide candidates with more realistic expectations of working conditions in the mining industry. These findings indicate that although the PMDP recruitment process has been running quite well, the company still needs to improve the effectiveness of internal coordination, consistency of selection schedules, and communication with candidates throughout the recruitment process.

These findings align with research (Alifah et al., 2025), which found that the process aspect of CIPP evaluations often faces challenges related to team coordination, communication, and time management.

Product Evaluation

Product evaluation was conducted to assess the outcomes and overall impact of the Prima Management Development Program (PMDP) on organizational workforce needs and talent development objectives. Based on interviews with Human Resource personnel and representatives from user departments, the majority of PMDP participants who successfully completed the recruitment and development stages demonstrated satisfactory adaptation to the organizational environment. Participants generally exhibited positive work performance, willingness to learn, and the ability to adjust to operational demands during both the development period and their initial job assignments.

The findings indicate that the PMDP has contributed positively to the company's recruitment strategy by providing candidates who are better aligned with organizational requirements compared to those recruited through conventional recruitment methods. This outcome can be attributed to the structured recruitment, assessment, and development processes embedded within the program, which enable the company to evaluate candidates comprehensively before placement. In addition, the program supports workforce regeneration by preparing a pool of young

professionals with leadership potential, thereby strengthening the organization's long-term succession planning strategy. According to Armstrong and Taylor (2014), management trainee programs play a strategic role in developing future organizational leaders and ensuring the sustainability of talent management initiatives.

Despite these positive outcomes, the evaluation identified several challenges that require managerial attention. Company records and interview results revealed that 38 participants withdrew during the initial placement stage. This finding suggests the existence of a mismatch between participant expectations and the realities of working in the mining industry, particularly regarding remote site assignments, rotational work schedules, and demanding operational conditions. Such circumstances indicate that prospective employees may not fully understand the nature of mining operations during the recruitment process. Therefore, improvements in employer branding, realistic job previews, recruitment communication, and candidate engagement strategies are necessary to ensure that applicants possess a more accurate understanding of job expectations before joining the program (Dessler, 2020).

Furthermore, the evaluation revealed that several participants still required additional support in developing technical competencies related to mining operations and adapting to the organizational culture within operational sites. Although the PMDP has successfully facilitated the transition of fresh graduates into the workforce, the findings highlight the importance of strengthening onboarding programs, mentoring systems, and competency development initiatives to accelerate employee adjustment and improve long-term retention. Effective onboarding processes have been widely recognized as essential mechanisms for enhancing employee commitment, job satisfaction, and organizational integration, particularly among newly recruited graduates (Bauer, 2010).

Overall, the PMDP has demonstrated a positive contribution to meeting the workforce needs of PT Prima Sarana Gemilang and supporting the company's long-term talent development strategy. The program has successfully generated a pipeline of potential employees and future leaders while improving the alignment between workforce supply and organizational demand. Nevertheless, continuous improvement is required, particularly in the areas of participant retention, employer branding, onboarding effectiveness, and technical competency development. Addressing these areas will enhance the overall effectiveness and sustainability of

the program in supporting organizational performance and future workforce requirements.

These findings are consistent with previous studies emphasizing that the product dimension of the CIPP evaluation model reflects the extent to which program outcomes contribute to organizational objectives. Research conducted by Subagiyo et al. (2026) demonstrated that successful recruitment programs are characterized by participants' adaptability, improved work performance, and meaningful contributions to organizational needs. Similarly, Stufflebeam and Shinkfield (2007) argue that product evaluation serves as a critical component for determining whether a program has achieved its intended outcomes and generated value for stakeholders.

CONCLUSION

Based on the research results, it can be concluded that the implementation of the PMDP recruitment strategy has generally been effective in supporting the company's need to acquire and prepare potential candidates, particularly fresh graduates, to meet operational and talent development needs in the mining industry. From a context perspective, the PMDP program has been designed to meet the organization's needs in building a talent pipeline and supporting workforce regeneration. This program is one of the company's strategies to address the limited sourcing of candidates aligned with the mining industry's needs. However, the company still faces challenges in obtaining candidates who understand the mining industry and are prepared to work in operational areas. From an input perspective, the company has a robust recruitment support system in place through SOPs, HR business processes, the use of digital recruitment platforms, and the involvement of multiple parties in the selection process to enhance the objectivity of candidate assessments. However, the study found that the limited number of recruiters, the high number of applicants, and the suboptimal standardization of assessments among interviewers still impact the effectiveness of the PMDP selection process. From a process perspective, the PMDP recruitment and selection process has been implemented in a structured manner, from job posting to onboarding. The use of psychological testing and competency-based interviews helps the company assess candidates' abilities and potential according to organizational needs.

However, the study revealed that challenges persisted in coordination, consistent selection schedules, and communicating information to candidates throughout the recruitment process. Meanwhile, in terms of product, the PMDP program yielded positive results in meeting the company's workforce needs and

developing talent. Most PMDP participants were able to adapt and demonstrate good work performance during the initial development period. However, some participants still needed to strengthen their technical competencies and adapt to the mining industry's work culture, requiring the company to strengthen its onboarding and participant development processes. Overall, this study demonstrates that evaluating recruitment strategies using the CIPP model provides a comprehensive overview of the effectiveness of PMDP implementation at PT Prima Sarana Gemilang. The results are expected to serve as a basis for company improvements, particularly in enhancing candidate sourcing effectiveness, standardizing the selection process, managing recruitment communications, and developing an onboarding system and strengthening participant competencies, all of which contribute to a more optimal and sustainable talent development process in the mining industry.

REFERENCES

- Alifah, D. S., Wardana, M. R., Cahyani, Y., Albana, I., Purwokerto, U. A., Utara, P., Banyumas, K., & Tengah, J. (2025). EVALUASI OPEN RECRUITMENT ORGANISASI INTERMEDIA. *Jurnal Media Akademik*, 3(12).
- Armstrong, M., & Taylor, S. (2014). *Armstrong's Handbook Of Human Resource Management Practice (13Th Editi)*. Kogan Page Limited.
- Azmy, A. (2019). Evaluation of Lecturer Recruitment Program at Tanri Abeng University. 6(7).
- Kharisma, I. M., & Wening, N. (2023). Peran Rekrutmen Dan Seleksi Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan Perusahaan : *Jurnal E-Bis: Ekonomi-Bisnis*, 7(1), 61–80.
- Manasikana, A., & Noor, T. R. (2025). Analysis Of The CIPP Model in Human Resource Management. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Sosial Keagamaan*, 5, 108–123.
- Muyana, S. (2017). Context Input Process Product (CIPP): Model Evaluasi Layanan Informasi. *Prosiding Seminar Bimbingan Dan Konseling*, 342–347.
- Poernomo, H., & Hartono. (2019). Pengaruh Rekrutmen Dan Seleksi Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan PT . Telkom Indonesia , Tbk CABANG. 2(1), 87–101.
- Sinamo, T., & Simarmata, N. (2023). Pengaruh Dukungan Sosial dengan Adaptabilitas Karier pada Fresh Graduates di Kota Medan. 3, 28–41.
- Sopha, S., & Nanni, A. (2019). The CIPP Model: Applications in Language Program Evaluation. *The Journal of Asia TEFL*, 16(4), 1360–1367.
- Subagiyo, A., Aswad, F. H., Badrun, M., & Siswoyo. (2026). Evaluasi implementasi program rekrutmen, seleksi dan penempatan pegawai BLUD Puskesmas di Kabupaten Lampung Tengah. *Malahayati Nursing Journal*, 8, 271–285.

Sugiyono. (2020). Metodologi Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R & D.

Unika Olo, R., Noronha, J., & Ximenes, M. (2026). Evaluation of recruitment and selection process to attract quality talent using the CIPP model at Plan International Timor-Leste. *International Journal of Human Resource Studies*, 1–15.

Veritia, & Daning. (2020). Pengaruh Rekrutmen dan Seleksi Karyawan Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan Pada PT Trinitas Mulia Abadi Jakarta Utara. *Jurnal Madani Ilmu Pengetahuan, Teknologi Dan Humaniora*, 3(1), 1–12.